

**Minutes of the 18th Board Meeting of the
Independent Commission for Aid Impact
3 December 2012**

Attendees

- Commissioners: Graham Ward (GW)
Mark Foster (MF)
Diana Good (DG)
- Secretariat: Tom McDonald (TM)
Alexandra Cran-McGreehin (AC-M)
Elspeth Robinson (ER)
- External: Sarah Dunn, DFID
Jon Gorrie, Matthew Smith, Mark Hellyer, Nigel Thornton,
KPMG
- Apologies: Santosh Chana (SC)
John Githongo (JG)
Professor Lawrence Haddad, Institute for Development Studies

Details of the meeting: Monday 3 December, 9.15 am – 3.00 pm

Welcome

1. The Chief Commissioner welcomed everyone to ICAI's 18th Board Meeting.

Minutes of the 17th Board Meeting

2. The minutes of the last ICAI Board meeting held on 12 November were formally approved.

Action Log

3. TM led a discussion of progress against both outstanding and completed actions from previous Board Meetings.

Correspondence and Meetings

4. TM ran through the correspondence received, including on the proposed Cabinet Office review.
5. There was a discussion of various meetings which had taken place, including TM's attendance at the OECD-DAC Evaluation Network and GW's meeting with Care.

Action Secretariat: TM to circulate notes of the Care and OECD-DAC meetings for Commissioners.

Risk Management

6. TM led a discussion of possible risks currently facing ICAI.

Discussion of DFID trade and economic development work in Southern Africa

7. Sarah Dunn, Head of DFID South Africa, introduced DFID's work on trade and economic development, noting that trade should be transformative for poverty in Africa. She described the various trade and economic development

organisations with responsibility in this area and explained the rationale behind the UK's regional approach.

Discussion of Recommendation Follow-Up Work

8. ER introduced her paper on follow-up work. Commissioners noted the need to avoid over-burdening DFID with this work but were very keen to follow up in a rigorous fashion. This was seen as a core ICAI role.
9. Commissioner discussed the need to consider whether the Department's responses addressed the original recommendations. They also discussed the need to look forward to this process when drafting recommendations in future in order to create a viable framework for follow-up.
10. Commissioners agreed to invite some DFID Senior Civil Service leads to Board meetings in order to hear for themselves how DFID is implementing recommendations. This would then be combined with written material prepared by the contractor for inclusion in the annual report.

Action Secretariat: To arrange follow up with SCS leads following action taken.

Programme Update

11. AC-M took Commissioners through a paper on the progress on the Year 2 work programme and the first reports for publication in Year 3 and an update on our work to finalise the year 3 work plan.
12. Commissioners agreed the work plan as proposed, with minor amendments. They also agreed that the work plan should be published following consultation with the International Development Committee.

Action Secretariat: To publish the work plan once IDC consultation complete.

Discussion with contractor

13. There was a discussion with representatives of the contractor team, including consideration of the structure of the consortium and the skills which should be available, given the future direction of the work programme.
14. KPMG agreed to submit a paper for the next Board covering these issues and other potential changes and to discuss it with Commissioners. The paper would include lessons learned from reports to date.

Action Contractor: To submit a paper for the next Board meeting.

15. There was a further discussion with the contractor, covering: the use of sub-contractors; developing content for the annual report; recommendation follow-up work; and feedback on the drafting process.
16. DG gave feedback on drafting, especially from the Nepal report and we discussed how to improve the initial findings and skeleton report processes.

AOB

17. Commissioners asked to receive hard copies of reports in the post after publication and to be sent copies of press releases at the point of distribution.

Action Secretariat: To implement this request.

Action Log from 15th ICAI Board Meeting

TM/AC-M	To liaise with DFID about publication of ICAI's four-year budget.	Y	Ongoing. DFID finance staff content with principle. Still in discussion with DFID to reconcile numbers with estimates process.
---------	---	---	--

Action Log from 18th ICAI Board Meeting

TM	To circulate notes of the Care and OECD-DAC meetings for Commissioners.	Y	Completed
Secretariat	To arrange follow up with SCS leads following action taken.		Ongoing
Secretariat	To publish the work plan once IDC consultation complete.	Y	Completed
Contractor	To submit a paper for the next Board meeting.	Y	Completed
Secretariat	To send hard copies of reports in the post after publication and to be sent copies of press releases at the point of distribution.	Y	Completed