

**Minutes of the 21<sup>st</sup> Board Meeting of the  
Independent Commission for Aid Impact  
24 May 2013**

**Attendees**

- Commissioners: Graham Ward (GW)  
Mark Foster (MF)  
Diana Good (DG)
- Secretariat: Tom McDonald (TM)  
Alexandra Cran-McGreehin (AC-M)  
Sam Harrison (SH)
- External: Richard Teuten (RT), Tim Wheeler (TW) (DFID);  
Steve Jones, Andrew Ockenden, Jon Gorrie, Matthew Smith
- Apologies: John Githongo (JG)  
Elspeth Robinson (ER)  
Santosh Chana (SC)

**Details of the meeting:** Thursday 24 May, 10.30 – 16.30

**Welcome**

1. The Chief Commissioner welcomed everyone to ICAI's 21<sup>st</sup> Board Meeting.

**Minutes of the 20<sup>th</sup> Board Meeting**

2. The minutes of the last ICAI Board meeting, held on 18 April 2013, were formally approved.

**Action Log**

3. TM led a discussion of progress against both outstanding and completed actions from previous Board Meetings.

**Correspondence and Meetings**

4. TM ran through the correspondence received and recent meetings. TM briefed Commissioners on the latest discussions with DFID in respect of the Triennial Review; the stakeholder meeting with BOND and UKAN; and his attendance at the DFID Audit Committee.
5. MF reported on his meeting with Richard Burden MP. He had discussed the OPTs visit and the processes involved in the production of our reports. GW reported on his speech at the Charity Finance Group conference.

**Risk Management**

6. TM led a discussion of possible risks currently facing ICAI. He briefed Commissioners on proposed amendments to the risk register which would be published as part of the ICAI Annual Report. Commissioners discussed the proposed amendments and agreed that they should be included in the Annual Report.

**Action Secretariat:** To include revised risk register in the next draft of the Annual Report.

### **Programme Update**

7. AC-M updated Commissioners on the status of the programme. MF commented that the innovation and learning report should now be referred to as the learning report. AC-M also led a discussion of our forthcoming review of Afghanistan, explaining that the Secretariat and contractor were looking at the various logistical and security issues involved.
8. AC-M led a discussion of contractor performance as part of a formal review which Commissioners are obliged to hold at this point – i.e. after two years of the contract's operation. Commissioners' views of contractor performance will form part of ICAI's Annual Report, to be published shortly.

**Action Secretariat:** To include account of contractor performance in the next draft of the Annual Report.

### **Discussion on Agriculture Research Review with Tim Wheeler, Deputy Chief Scientific Officer, DFID**

9. GW welcomed Tim Wheeler, Deputy Chief Scientific Officer, DFID, who was invited to provide an introduction to the subject of agricultural research as background to ICAI's forthcoming report in this field.
10. TW presented an overview of DFID's research organisation, with a focus on agricultural research. He explained that research was based on the DFID priorities which had inputs from ministerial and global priorities and was also influenced by a paper on agriculture and food by the Government's previous Chief Scientific Adviser, Sir John Beddington. Current priorities focussed on climate resilient crops and vaccines for livestock.
11. TW gave examples of some of the projects that addressed poverty, such as bio-fortifying sweet potatoes and provision of vitamin A. He went on to describe DFID's risk appetite for its research work and how it dealt with project failure.
12. GW thanked TW for his interesting presentation.

### **Follow up discussion with Richard Teuten on ICAI's World Bank Report**

13. GW welcomed Richard Teuten, Head of the International Financial Institutions Department, DFID.
14. RT gave an overview of progress against recommendations since the ICAI report on the World Bank. He felt that some of the recommendations that ICAI made had been more helpful than others and also noted that most of them were in line with actions that were taking place regardless of the review.
15. RT felt, however, that, as a result of the report, DFID now had further impetus to drive reform in the World Bank and were seeking out champions of change to further the reform agenda. There had already been an impact on trust funds, where ICAI's report had focussed minds and led to some trust funds being shut down.

16. Turning to the Asian Development Bank report, RT reported that it was more difficult to work in areas where there were no country offices, hence a lack of progress on recommendation four of the report. He also felt that there were difficulties in implementing some of the recommendations, given the breadth of the ADB's role.

#### **ICAI Annual Report**

17. TM introduced a discussion of the ICAI 2012-13 Annual Report. The Commissioners and the Secretariat discussed the content of the draft Annual Report. There was a focus on the follow up to ICAI's Year 1 reports and their impact and it was agreed that this would be looked at in greater detail. TM agreed to circulate a further draft shortly.

**Action Secretariat:** To produce next draft of the Annual Report.

#### **Triennial Review of ICAI**

18. Commissioners considered the Stage 1 Review paper submitted to ICAI by DFID and discussed the issues it raised. It was agreed that the Secretariat would draft a letter in response to the draft.

**Action Secretariat:** To draft response letter to DFID on the Triennial Review.

#### **Discussion with contractor**

19. Commissioners gave feedback to the contractor core team on their observations of fieldwork undertaken in various locations.
20. The contractor core team updated Commissioners on progress with upcoming reports and took note of Commissioners' comments.

#### **AOB**

21. TM informed Commissioners that, after a successful recruitment exercise, a new Programme Manager had been appointed. He will start work from July 2013. Commissioners asked TM to circulate his CV to them.

**Action Secretariat:** To send new Programme Manager's CV to Commissioners.

Action Log from 18<sup>th</sup> ICAI Board Meeting

Secretariat	To arrange follow up with SCS leads following action taken.	Ongoing. One remaining meeting to be organised.
-------------	---	---

Action Log from 19<sup>th</sup> ICAI Board Meeting

Secretariat	To invite Transparency International to meet Commissioners.	Ongoing but contact has been made.
-------------	---	------------------------------------

Action Log from 20<sup>th</sup> ICAI Board Meeting

Secretariat / contractor	To arrange a session for DG to talk to team leaders and staff about field work preparations.	In discussion with contractor to arrange
--------------------------	--	--

Action Log from 21<sup>st</sup> ICAI Board Meeting

Secretariat	To include revised risk register in the next draft of the Annual Report.	Completed
Secretariat	To include account of contractor performance in the next draft of the Annual Report.	Completed
Secretariat	To produce next draft of the Annual Report.	Completed
Secretariat	To draft response letter to DFID on the Triennial Review.	Completed
Secretariat	To send new Programme Manager's CV to Commissioners.	Completed