

**Minutes of the 24th Board Meeting of the
Independent Commission for Aid Impact
27 September 2013**

Attendees

Commissioners: Graham Ward (GW)
Mark Foster (MF)
Diana Good (DG)

Secretariat: Alexandra Cran-McGreehin (AC-M)
Matthew Wilkins (MW)
Elspeth Robinson (ER)

External: Ellen Wratten – DFID Deputy Director of the Policy Division (EW)
Tim Wheeler – DFID Deputy Chief Scientific Adviser, Acting Director of Research and Evidence Division (TW)
Anne Fraser – DFID Principal Knowledge Coordinator and Head of Profession (AFr)
Alistair Fernie – DFID Head of Private Sector Department (AFe)
Alan Downey – KPMG (AD)
Jon Gorrie – KPMG (JG)
Matthew Smith – KPMG (MS)
Nigel Thornton - Agulhas (NT)

Apologies: John Githongo (ICAI Commissioner)
Sam Harrison (ICAI Communications Manager)

Details of the meeting: Friday 27th September, 09:15 – 17:45

Welcome

1. The Chief Commissioner welcomed everyone to ICAI's 24th Board Meeting and thanked Commissioners and the Secretariat team for their hard work over the summer months.

Minutes of the 23rd Board Meeting

2. The minutes of the last ICAI Board meeting, held on 9th July 2013, were formally approved.

Action Log

3. AC-M led a discussion of progress against both outstanding and completed actions from previous Board Meetings.
4. ER updated Commissioners on advice from DFID officials relating to changes DFID is making to its formal progress reporting. This reporting sets out DFID's progress in implementing management actions it has proposed, to respond to ICAI recommendations. The changes will involve more concise reporting on an annual rather than six-monthly basis to avoid duplication with ICAI's annual recommendation follow-up process. Commissioners decided to write to the Permanent Secretary acknowledging the changes and discussing how they relate to our follow-up process which is due to start soon for Year 2 reports.

Action Secretariat: To agree letter with GW regarding DFID reporting on management actions and send to Mark Lowcock.

Correspondence and Meetings

5. AC-M summarised the correspondence received and recent meetings. GW and DG reported on their meetings with Sarah Dunn (Head of DFID Southern Africa) about the trade in Southern Africa report; and Joy Hutcheon (DFID Director General for

Country Programmes) about the Montserrat report. There was also a discussion on forthcoming meetings that need to be scheduled in the autumn.

Risk Management

6. AC-M led a discussion of risk management issues. Commissioners agreed that they particularly wanted to be kept updated about the transition to phase two of ICAI's operations in May 2015 (subject to the outcome of the Triennial Review).

Triennial Review

7. AC-M updated Commissioners on the current progress of the review, which is awaiting a decision from ministers in DFID and the Cabinet Office.

Discussion with Ellen Wratten, Tim Wheeler and Anne Fraser in connection with the Learning Review

8. Commissioners, AC-M, MW and NT met with EW, TW and AF to discuss ICAI's current review of how DFID learns. EW, TW and AF provided ICAI with an overview of how they believe DFID corporately encourages learning by its employees, how approaches have evolved over time and recent developments designed to improve learning. Commissioners were keen to discuss with DFID the practical application of learning initiatives and how they result in improved delivery of programmes and their impact.

Programme Update

9. MW updated the meeting about the programme. He reported that Year 3 was on track and gave Commissioners an update on the position regarding ICAI's programme budget. Commissioners agreed to substitute the timing of the reports on the International Climate Fund and nutrition. The nutrition review will now start its terms of reference process.
10. MW also presented a revised ICAI Assessment Framework. A further round of Commissioner comments was discussed.

Action Secretariat: To circulate the revised Assessment Framework for final Commissioner comments.

Year 4 work plan

11. AC-M reported on Year 4 planning and gave an overview of the responses to the recent consultation on possible Year 4 report topics. ICAI had received suggestions from the International Development Select Committee, DFID (including the Secretary of State), NGOs and development specialists, among others. Commissioners gave an initial view but asked for further analysis of the proposals to be presented at the October Board meeting.

Action Secretariat: To present further analysis of Year 4 report proposals at the October Board meeting.

Discussion with Alistair Fernie on DFID's Private Sector Portfolio in connection with the Private Sector Report

12. AFe gave Commissioners an overview of the role and history of the Department's work with the private sector and set out his top priorities.
13. In response to Commissioners' questions, AFe also detailed the skill sets of staff, including those on secondment from the private sector. He also discussed DFID's current theory of change in this area and how to ensure joined-up working across

DFID departments and spread best practice, including through the private sector development cadre of advisers.

Discussion with the Contractor Consortium

14. GW and the Commissioners led a discussion with contractor representatives. They said that they appreciated the contractor's hard work over the summer. Commissioners gave feedback on contractor performance in recent reviews. There was discussion of the handling of potential conflicts of interest, the need for advanced planning and processes of engagement with Commissioners at the beginning of reviews.
15. The Year 4 work plan proposals were discussed. Commissioners noted that consultation responses had relevance not just for these proposals but also for some of ICAI's current Year 3 reviews.

Action Contractor: To ensure that consultation responses are fed into Year 3 reviews where relevant.

Action Log from 19th ICAI Board Meeting (26th February 2013)

Secretariat	To invite Transparency International to meet Commissioners.	Ongoing. JG has supplied new contact.
-------------	---	---------------------------------------

Action Log from 20th ICAI Board Meeting (18th April 2013)

Secretariat / contractor	To arrange a session for DG to talk to team leaders and staff about field work preparations.	In discussion with contractor to arrange a training conference (as per action from 23 rd Board meeting)
--------------------------	--	--

Action Log from 22nd ICAI Board Meeting (19th June 2013)

Secretariat	To produce updated Communications Strategy.	Ongoing
-------------	---	---------

Action Log from 23rd ICAI Board Meeting (9th July 2013)

Secretariat	To produce proposals for Year 4 work plan based on consultations	Complete
Secretariat	To discuss with DFID about formal recommendation reporting moving to an annual system taking place in December	Complete
Secretariat	Consortium to arrange training conference.	In progress – finding suitable date
Secretariat	To build events into communications planning.	Ongoing

Action Log from 24th ICAI Board Meeting (27th September 2013)

Secretariat	To agree letter with GW regarding DFID reporting on management actions and send to Mark Lowcock	
Secretariat	To circulate the revised Assessment Framework for final Commissioner comments.	
Secretariat	To present further analysis of Year 4 report proposals at the October Board meeting.	
Contractor	To ensure that consultation responses are fed into Year 3 reviews where relevant.	