

**Minutes of the 25th Board Meeting of the
Independent Commission for Aid Impact
29th October 2013**

Attendees

Chief Commissioner: Graham Ward (GW)

Commissioners: Mark Foster (MF)
Diana Good (DG)

Secretariat: Alexandra Cran-McGreehin (AC-M)
Sam Harrison (SH)
Matthew Wilkins (MW)
Elspeth Robinson (ER)

External: Jon Gorrie – KPMG (JG)
Matthew Smith – KPMG (MS)

Apologies: John Githongo (ICAI Commissioner)
Justin Forsyth (Save the Children)

Details of the meeting: Tuesday 29th October, 09:00 – 17:00

Welcome

1. The Chief Commissioner welcomed everyone to ICAI's 25th Board Meeting.

Minutes of the 24th Board Meeting

2. The minutes of the last ICAI Board meeting, held on 27th September, were discussed and approved.

Action Log

3. AC-M led a discussion of progress against both outstanding and completed actions from previous Board meetings. ER clarified the approach to logging outstanding actions from past Board meetings, which included the removal of actions once they have been listed as "complete" in one set of minutes. This was noted by Commissioners.

Correspondence and Meetings

4. AC-M summarised the correspondence received and recent meetings held. MF reported on his appearance before the International Development Committee's Sub-Committee regarding our review of DFID's Support to Palestine Refugees through UNRWA. GW spoke about his session with the Committee on the Burma and Montserrat reports. Both sessions were felt to be valuable.
5. Commissioners also discussed the International Development Committee's recently published report on our Annual Report.

Risk Management

6. AC-M led a discussion of risk management issues.

Programme Update

7. ER updated the meeting on the current status of the programme. She reported that Year 3 was on track and gave Commissioners an overview of when upcoming visits were planned and when draft documents were likely to be sent for Commissioner input. Commissioners requested that an updated set of dates be sent to them once

the timetable for Year 4 reports had been agreed. MW gave Commissioners an update on the current position of ICAI's programme budget.

Action Secretariat: To send an updated timetable of upcoming work to Commissioners once the Year 4 timetable is confirmed.

8. MF fed back to other Commissioners on the success of the expert panel in the Child Mortality review. Commissioners agreed that this approach was useful and should be considered for other reports in the future.
9. SH fed back on a stakeholder session with non-governmental organisations for the Private Sector Development (PSD) review. This considered how DFID might be able to offer better value in its PSD activity. A note of this meeting was requested by DG and it was agreed that this had been a helpful approach which should be replicated for other reviews.

Action Secretariat: To send a meeting note of the stakeholder session held for the Private Sector review to Commissioners.

10. There was a short discussion on the coverage of the report on Agricultural Research.
11. ER presented an item on the revised ICAI Assessment Framework with proposals for its distribution and publication. Commissioners discussed publishing a briefing paper which will set out the new framework and explain the changes that have been made; and outline our approach to reviews and the focus on impact for intended beneficiaries. SH added that this paper would be published on the ICAI website.

Action Secretariat: To write a short briefing paper to sit alongside the Assessment Framework. This should explain the new framework and outline our approach to reviews.

Triennial Review

12. AC-M updated Commissioners on the current position of the Triennial Review.

Phase 2: ICAI post May 2015

13. AC-M led a discussion regarding the risks to continuity of the ICAI programme post May 2015.
14. There was a discussion on the need to recruit new Commissioners for ICAI Phase 2 (subject to the outcome of the Triennial Review). It was agreed that the Chief Commissioner would write to DFID to give an outline of what qualities and experience a Commissioner should possess.

Action Secretariat: To collate Commissioner views and draft a letter to the Secretary of State regarding future Commissioner recruitment.

Communications Strategy

15. SH presented a paper which updated Commissioners on progress made on ICAI communications. He highlighted that lead Commissioners had been more visible on report communications and that there had been positive feedback from the IDC on MF's blog on his country visits to the Occupied Palestinian Territories, Jordan and Lebanon for the UNRWA report.
16. There followed a discussion on ways to improve communications with DFID country offices and to discuss our findings post-report, both of which formed part of the conclusions of the IDC's report on ICAI's Annual Report. It was agreed that SH would develop a presentation which Commissioners could give on country visits and that he would also investigate a programme of post-report sessions with DFID staff and stakeholders.

Action Secretariat: To draft a presentation for country visits and to investigate the options for carrying out learning sessions with stakeholders following report publication.

Year 4 work plan

17. MW reported on the selection of reviews for the Year 4 work programme in the light of our public consultation. Over the summer Commissioners had agreed to undertake up to 9 reviews for Year 4, including a mixture of thematic and more targeted reports, noting likely limitations of purdah. It was agreed that some additional proposals were also interesting and should be considered for the future work programme. It was agreed that a letter to the IDC should be drafted seeking approval of the work plan.

Action Secretariat: To write to the IDC requesting approval of the proposed Year 4 work programme.

Discussion with the Contractor Consortium

18. Commissioners led a discussion with contractor representatives. Progress on current reviews was discussed and Commissioners gave feedback on contractor performance in recent reviews. There was a discussion on review methodologies and the ICAI approach to interviews, where views expressed by interviewees are unattributable in our reports to ensure interviewee protection.
19. There was a conversation on preparation for some upcoming internal meetings, including a conference involving team leaders and Commissioners to learn from our experiences so far. The contractor was asked to propose an agenda for Commissioners to review.

Action Contractor: To write and distribute an agenda for the learning conference, including topics for discussion and who will lead each item.

Action Log from 19th ICAI Board Meeting (26th February 2013)

| | | |
|-------------|---|----------|
| Secretariat | To invite Transparency International to meet Commissioners. | Complete |
|-------------|---|----------|

Action Log from 20th ICAI Board Meeting (18th April 2013)

| | | |
|--------------------------|--|----------|
| Secretariat / contractor | To arrange a session for DG to talk to team leaders and staff about field work preparations. | Complete |
|--------------------------|--|----------|

Action Log from 22nd ICAI Board Meeting (19th June 2013)

| | | |
|-------------|---|----------|
| Secretariat | To produce updated Communications Strategy. | Complete |
|-------------|---|----------|

Action Log from 23rd ICAI Board Meeting (9th July 2013)

| | | |
|-------------|---|----------|
| Secretariat | Consortium to arrange training conference. | Complete |
| Secretariat | To build events into communications planning. | Complete |

Action Log from 24th ICAI Board Meeting (27th September 2013)

| | | |
|-------------|---|----------|
| Secretariat | To agree letter with GW regarding DFID reporting on management actions and send to Mark Lowcock | Complete |
| Secretariat | To circulate the revised Assessment Framework for final Commissioner comments. | Complete |
| Secretariat | To present further analysis of Year 4 report proposals at the October Board meeting. | Complete |
| Contractor | To ensure that consultation responses are fed into Year 3 reviews where relevant. | On-going |

Action Log from 25th ICAI Board Meeting (29th October 2013)

| | | |
|-------------|--|--|
| Secretariat | To send an updated timetable of upcoming work to Commissioners once the Year 4 timetable is confirmed. | |
| Secretariat | To send a meeting note of the stakeholder session held for the Private Sector review to Commissioners. | |
| Secretariat | To write a short briefing paper to sit alongside the Assessment Framework. This should explain the new framework and outline our approach to reviews. | |
| Secretariat | To collate Commissioner views and draft a letter to the Secretary of State regarding future Commissioner recruitment. | |
| Secretariat | To draft presentation for country visits and to investigate the options for carrying out learning sessions with stakeholders following report publication. | |
| Secretariat | To write to the IDC requesting approval of the proposed Year 4 work programme. | |
| Contractor | To write and distribute an agenda for the learning conference, including topics for discussion and who will lead each item. | |