

Minutes of the 52nd Board Meeting of the Independent Commission for Aid Impact

Date 4 December 2018

Attendees

Commissioners: Alison Evans
Tina Fahm
Richard Gledhill
Tamsyn Barton

Secretariat: Ekpe Attah
Andrew Forbes
Gemma Kinnear
Chloe Lawson-Duffy
Rebecca Lefort
Miriam McCarthy
Michael O'Donnell
Pauline Worthington
Cvetina Yocheva

Service provider (workplan sessions only):

Lauren Pett
Nigel Thornton

1. ICAI Formal Update

Minutes and actions of the 10 September Board Meeting

- 1.1 The Chief Commissioner formally welcomed the incoming Chief Commissioner, Tamsyn Barton, to ICAI and the board meeting.
- 1.2 The minutes of the 10 September 2018 ICAI Board meeting were agreed as an accurate record. The action points from the previous meetings action logs were reviewed.
- 1.3 Commissioners reviewed action 1 and approved the draft format of the impact log, discussing how to capture all examples of the impact of ICAI reviews.
- 1.4 Commissioners reviewed action 7 and discussed recent feedback on service provider induction of team leaders.

Action: Secretariat to propose a process to ensure all examples of ICAI impact, particularly from the Follow Up review, are recorded and evaluated.

Action: Secretariat to review induction of service provider team leaders with the new service provider.

Business Update

- 1.5 The Secretariat updated Commissioners on spend to end of October 2018 and advised that the current forecast for total spend in this financial year is within budget.
- 1.6 The Commissioners agreed with the recommendation not to align the ICAI year and DFID financial year.
- 1.7 There are no safeguarding issues to report under ICAI's safeguarding policy. Commissioners discussed non ICAI related safeguarding issues identified during individual review information gathering activities.
- 1.8 Commissioners discussed the Tailored Review request that ICAI investigate the total costs of each review.
- 1.9 The Commissioners noted the update on actions to ensure compliance with GDPR.

Action: Secretariat to discuss expectations with DFID and prepare a protocol for reporting third-party safeguarding issues identified during reviews. This protocol should be published.

Action: Secretariat to consider how to apportion central costs to each individual review.

Corporate Risk Register

- 1.10 Commissioners reviewed the Corporate Risk Register, noted the highest risks and discussed risks to delivery and improvements to the review drafting process.
- 1.11 Commissioners discussed external risks to delivery including the 2019 spending review.

Action: Secretariat to continue investigating the drafting process to identify improvements to the emerging findings and skeleton draft stage.

Action: Secretariat to meet with Richard Gledhill to discuss improvements to the drafting process.

Action: Secretariat to add a risk relating to the impact on delivery of our workplan from the changing external environment.

Corporate KPIs

- 2.1 ICAI has continued to perform well against its KPIs. Commissioners discussed the need to continue to develop these KPIs over the next commission possibly linking them to ICAI's Theory of Change.
- 2.2 Commissioners discussed the challenges in getting engagement on stakeholder satisfaction exercises and the merits of commissioning a third party to carry out some research.

Action: Phase III Commissioners to investigate the option of commissioning a third party to assist with data collection for corporate KPIs.

Transition Update

- 3.1 Commissioners were updated on progress with the transition project. Outcome letters have been sent to bidders and the standstill period ends on 11 December at which point, subject to Secretary of State approval, the secretariat can start discussions with the preferred supplier.
- 3.2 Plans for recruiting the new Commissioners are on schedule and the Head of Secretariat is talking to colleagues in Cabinet Office and DFID about the recruitment process.
- 3.3 The exercise to recruit a new Head of Reviews was unsuccessful and the post will be re-advertised. The Head of Secretariat is investigating options for an interim appointment.

Action: Head of Secretariat to discuss options for interim appointment to Head of Reviews post with Commissioners.

Workplan Update

- 4.1 The Secretariat advised Commissioners that the current workplan to June 2019 is progressing largely to schedule with minor delays on a couple of interim deadlines.
- 4.2 Following discussions on themes, the service provider has written draft terms of reference for the final Phase II review. Commissioners discussed the review and agreed that this would not be scored but they would like to present it to IDC and hold a dissemination event with stakeholders.
- 4.3 Commissioners expressed their thanks to the departing Head of Reviews for his work on the planning of the remaining Phase II reviews.

Action: Secretariat to decide who will take responsibility for the Head of Reviews input into the Annual Report.

Action: Terms of reference for the final Phase II review to be signed off by Commissioners after they meet next week.

Phase III Reviews

- 5.1 The incoming Chief Commissioner has agreed the concept notes for the initial five Phase III reviews and stressed the importance of salience when deciding on publication dates. The secretariat is drafting terms of reference and identifying timelines for production. Commissioners provided feedback on these concept notes and discussed the possibility of existing Commissioners acting as shadow peer reviewers.
- 5.2 Commissioners discussed the need to start work on scoping the remaining Phase III Year 1 review topics to avoid a gap in report publication between March and June 2020.

Action: The Secretariat will continue work on finalising the terms of reference for the initial five Phase III reviews and the Head of Reviews will aim to finalise 2 or 3 of these before his departure.

Action: Secretariat will discuss Phase III review timelines with the new service provider as soon as possible.

Action: Existing and incoming Chief Commissioners to discuss further Phase III review topics.

AOB

- 6.1 The Head of Secretariat updated Commissioners on recent Freedom of Information requests.
- 6.2 Commissioners thanked Alison for her work as Chief Commissioner.
- 6.3 The date of next Board meeting to be confirmed.

Action Log from 52nd Board Meeting (4 December 2018)

No.	Action by	Action	Status
1	Secretariat	Secretariat to propose a process to ensure all examples of ICAI impact, particularly from the Follow Up review, are recorded and evaluated.	
2	Secretariat	Secretariat to review induction of service provider team leaders with the new service provider.	
3	Secretariat	Secretariat to discuss expectations with DFID and prepare a protocol for reporting third-party safeguarding issues identified during reviews. This protocol should be published.	
4	Secretariat	Secretariat to consider how to apportion central costs to each individual review.	
5	Secretariat	Secretariat to continue investigating the drafting process to identify improvements to the emerging findings and skeleton draft stage.	
6	Secretariat	Secretariat to meet with Richard Gledhill to discuss improvements to the drafting process.	
7	Secretariat	Secretariat to add a risk relating to the impact on delivery of our workplan from the changing external environment.	
8	Commissioners	Phase III Commissioners to investigate the option of commissioning a third party to assist with data collection for corporate KPIs.	
9	Secretariat	Head of Secretariat to discuss options for interim appointment to Head of Reviews post with Commissioners.	
10	Secretariat	Secretariat to decide who will take responsibility for the Head of Reviews input into the Annual Report.	
11	Commissioners	Terms of reference for the final Phase II review to be signed off by Commissioners after they meet next week.	
12	Secretariat	The Secretariat will continue work on finalising the terms of reference for the initial five Phase III reviews and the Head of Reviews will aim to finalise 2 or 3 of these before his departure.	
13	Secretariat	Secretariat will discuss Phase III review timelines with the new service provider as soon as possible.	
14	Commissioners	Existing and incoming Chief Commissioners to discuss further Phase III review topics.	

Action Log from 51st Board Meeting (10 Sept 2018)

No.	Action by	Action	Status
1	Secretariat	Secretariat to include a summary of impact log in business update as a standard item.	In progress

Action Log from 45th Board Meeting (7 March 2017)

No.	Action by	Action	Status
2	Secretariat	The Secretariat to gather views on ICAI's review typology from key stakeholders.	Initial briefing paper developed by secretariat; to be taken forward under direction of incoming Chief Commissioner