

**5th Board Meeting of the
Independent Commission for Aid Impact
13 July 2011**

Attendees

Commissioners: Graham Ward (GW)
 Mark Foster (MF)
 Diana Good (DG)
 John Githongo (JG) by telephone link until 3.30 pm

Secretariat: Tom McDonald (TM)
 Santosh Chana (SC)
 Alexandra Cran-McGreehin (AC-M)

Apologies: Clare Robathan (CR)

Details of the meeting Wednesday 13 July, 11.30 am – 5.45 pm

Welcome and Introductions

1. The Chief Commissioner welcomed everyone to the 5th Board Meeting of ICAI and introduced the newest member of the ICAI team, Alexandra Cran-McGreehin, who will be joining the Secretariat on 1 August. AC-M gave the Board an overview of her background and her interest in taking on the job of Programme Manager.

Minutes of the 4th Board Meeting

2. The Commissioners approved the minutes of the last Board meeting.

Action Log

3. TM led a discussion of progress against the action log from the last meeting. It was noted that:

- a list of DFID documentation given to Commissioners at ICAI Induction Days had been produced and will be available on the virtual knowledge-sharing web site;
- e-mails notifying Commissioners of new documents that have been uploaded to the virtual web site will include a link to that document;
- the meeting to examine how DFID works with private institutions will be postponed until early next year when the Board will have a better overview of DFID's work in that area;
- DFID will provide data on how many staff are employed in each country office; and
- The Board was content with the report on their visit to Sierra Leone, subject to minor amendments.

Correspondence

4. TM updated the Commissioners on what correspondence had been sent and received by ICAI. The Board noted that:

- GW had written to Mark Lowcock to congratulate him on his appointment to Permanent Secretary and to arrange a meeting to discuss the work plan and hear his views on the challenges and opportunities facing both DFID and ICAI;
- The Chief Commissioner had received a letter from the Chief Executive of Water Aid.

Action SC: To arrange for GW to meet with the Permanent Secretary, DFID

Action TM/AC-M: To consider Water Aid's comments when the Terms of Reference are prepared for the Water and Sanitation in Sudan report in Year 2.

Communications Strategy

5. TM introduced the draft communications strategy paper prepared by CR. This followed agreement at the last Board meeting that a strategy should be drafted in order to build the visibility of ICAI and prepare for the publication of reports. During a detailed discussion, the following points were made:

- the hard facts of each report should be enlivened and informed by impressions from real people and the report should present those impressions in a balanced manner;
- where recipient voices have been used, names and other personal details should be anonymised to protect identities;
- the contractor will be asked to make clear in the inception reports who the beneficiaries are and to specify if there are different groups of beneficiaries or affected parties;
- the contractor should be enlisted to help take forward the communication strategy.

Action TM: To brief CR on return on the Board's discussion.

Action CR: to take forward the communication strategy with KPMG.

Terms of Reference

6. The Board discussed the terms of reference produced by KPMG for each of the following six reports commissioned by the Board at its last meeting:

1. Study of value for money and aid effectiveness;
2. DFID's health programme in Zimbabwe;
3. DFID's climate change programme in Bangladesh;
4. DFID's anti-corruption strategy;
5. Programme controls and assurance in Afghanistan; and

6. DFID's management of budget support.

7. In general discussion, it was noted that:

- once the terms of reference for a report had been approved by the Board, KPMG will produce an inception report which will specify: the budget, how long the study will take, who will be conducting the study and their qualifications, what methodologies will be used and other details;
- GW will sign the contracts once the inception reports are approved by the Board;
- the terms of reference should be published at the same time as the reports;
- in all terms of reference the contractor will be asked to look into how DFID staff monitor programme delivery to check progress;
- TM and KPMG will be meeting the nominated DFID senior lead for each of the reports to discuss the terms of reference;
- consideration should be given to producing a one page introduction letter to brief host governments and possibly NGOs on the study being conducted in that country;
- KPMG should be commissioned now to produce the terms of reference for the next batch of reports to keep the momentum of the work plan flowing; and
- DFID will be asked to provide a two-page summary of the programmes being delivered in that country or sector. It should also include the input other organisations/agencies have in those programmes, the scale, allocation of spend along with any other relevant information. This summary will be a pre-requisite for all future reports which will inform the terms of reference.

8. In detailed discussion on each of the terms of reference, the Board agreed that:

Study of value for money and effectiveness

- Value for money and effectiveness as part of the evaluation of impact should be seen as the same;
- Commissioners' criteria need to be built into and annexed to the terms of reference;
- The report should look at qualitative as well as quantitative measures;
- KPMG should source a copy of DFID's 26 measures of value for money to inform the terms of reference;
- CEGA will be invited to the next Board Meeting in September; and
- the terms of reference will be amended to take account of the Board's comments and forwarded to Commissioners for approval

DFID's health programme in Zimbabwe

- MF would accompany the study team to Zimbabwe, if timings permit; and
- The report should look at DFID's overall health programme but also look at the related use of microfinance and other modalities.

DFID's climate change programme in Bangladesh

- The terms of reference should look at the balance of development and preparedness, which includes the gap between the emergency response to recovery.

DFID's anti-corruption strategy

- The Board formally approved the terms of reference for the report on DFID's anti-corruption strategy.

Programme controls and assurance in Afghanistan

- The terms of reference should make reference to the beneficiaries; and
- There are considerable security considerations in relation to travel around Afghanistan, which might make it difficult to carry out some methods or lines of inquiry. These considerations should be made clear in the final report.

DFID's management of budget support.

- This report should add value to the National Audit Office study and ensure that DFID has followed up the NAO's recommendations;
- There should be case studies to compare and contrast the intended impact; and
- The terms of reference should include any DFID budget support exit strategy and examples of exit support.

Next Batch of Reports

9. TM set out the likely timetable for Commissioner approval of Terms of Reference for the next three batches of reports, with those batches due for discussion at each of the September, October and November Boards. TM proposed sending a prioritised list of terms of reference for the remaining 10 reports.

Action TM: To email Commissioners with a prioritised approval timetable for the remaining 10 terms of reference.

Corporate Plan

10. TM noted the requirement for ICAI to produce a Corporate Plan and that good progress had been made in drafting one, despite a lack of specific guidance for Advisory Non-Departmental Public Bodies. It was now important to complete a draft and send round for Commissioner approval in time for the September Board.

Action TM: To email Commissioners with draft Corporate Plan in time for final approval by the September Board.

Discussion of Terms of Reference with KPMG

11. TM gave KPMG an overview of the Board's earlier discussion on each of the terms of reference for the six commissioned reports and gave a summary of the Board's comments. An in-depth discussion followed on how to take the work forward. The Board approved the terms of reference for the anti-corruption strategy and asked KPMG to amend the other five terms of reference taking account of their comments.

Action TM: To take forward the changes to the terms of reference with KPMG.

Action Log from 5rd ICAI Board Meeting

Outstanding actions

Who	Action	Completed?	Notes
CR	To obtain a quote for the copyright of the ICAI brand		
SC	To arrange for GW to meet with the Permanent Secretary, DFID	Y	Confirmed for 8 September
TM/AC-M	To consider Water Aid's comments when the terms of reference is prepared for the Water and Sanitation in Sudan report in Year 2		
TM	Brief CR on return on the Board's discussion on the Communication Strategy	Y	
CR	To take forward the communication strategy with KPMG		
TM	To email Commissioners with a prioritised approval timetable for the remaining 10 terms of reference.	Y	
TM	To email Commissioners with draft Corporate Plan in time for final approval by September Board.		
TM	To take forward the changes to the terms of reference with KPMG	Y	