

**6th Board Meeting of the
Independent Commission for Aid Impact
7 September 2011**

Attendees

Commissioners: Graham Ward (GW)
Mark Foster (MF)
Diana Good (DG)
John Githongo (JG)
Secretariat: Tom McDonald (TM)
Clare Robathan (CR)
Santosh Chana (SC)

Apologies: Alexandra Cran-McGreehin (AC-M)

Details of the meeting: Wednesday 7 September, 9.00 am – 5.30 pm

Welcome

1. The Chief Commissioner welcomed everyone to ICAI's 6th Board Meeting.

Minutes of the 5th Board Meeting

2. The Commissioners approved the minutes of the last Board meeting.

Action Log

3. TM led a discussion of progress against the action log from the previous meeting. Previous actions had been completed.

Correspondence

4. CR reported that one FOI request had been received.

Any Other Business

5. TM provided an update on DFID's programme in Sierra Leone, which Commissioners had requested following their visit in May.

Status of ICAI reports

6. CR confirmed to the Board that ICAI reports are not covered by Parliamentary privilege. The Board asked to be fully briefed on the legislative frameworks dealing with defamation/libel and money-laundering/corruption issues. They wished to be clear what reporting frameworks they should follow.

Action CR: To gather standard guidance for Commissioners to then take a view on whether further guidance is necessary.

Future travel plans

7. DG enquired as to progress in this area.

Action CR: To provide outline programme for Pakistan visit for next board meeting.

Trademark of ICAI logo

8. CR outlined the process and costs associated with trademarking the ICAI logo, as recommended by the Intellectual Property Office. The Board agreed on the

trademarking of the ICAI logo within the UK and asked that CR investigate the costs of trademarking the logo in other English-speaking countries.

Action CR: To proceed with the process for trademarking the logo in the UK and investigate the costs of trademarking in other English-speaking countries and present this to the Board to consider.

Professor Paul Collier

9. GW welcomed Paul Collier to the Board meeting. After introductions, GW asked for Professor Collier's specific thoughts on budgetary support, governance, World Bank issues, the theory of change in development and on fraud and corruption.

Update on Inception Reports and budget

10. TM updated the Board on the status of the inception reports produced by the contractor and the cost of the reports already commissioned. In discussion, It was noted that:

- GW had reminded the contractor at a recent meeting that their proposals should match all aspects of their bid. This should help ensure that the studies being carried out would be efficient and economical;
- the contractor should conduct a 'walk through' test to see what is happening on the ground for each study;
- TM confirmed that the Secretariat is being notified by the contractor of any possible conflicts of interest for future reports;
- the Board asked for a paper to be produced for the next Board Meeting on how the contractor had set up and costed one of the studies already commissioned;
- the Board agreed that a lead Commissioner should be nominated for each study; and
- AC-M is producing a programme document which will have detailed information on the remaining Year 1 studies, including an outline timetable, names of contractor team leaders and budget. Lead Commissioners' names will also be included. This will also contain a forecast of the overall budgetary position for the remainder of Year 1 and look at the flexibility of the budget between years;

Action TM/AC-M: To produce a paper on how the contractor had set up and costed one of the studies already commissioned.

Action AC-M: To produce a programme document detailing information on the remaining Year 1 reports.

Corporate Plan 2011-2012

11. There was an in-depth discussion of the Corporate Plan and the Board approved its publication, subject to minor amendments.

Terms of Reference

12. The Board discussed the terms of reference and an Options paper for the following reports:

1. DFID/Nike Girl Hub;
2. DFID's use of technical consultants;
3. Comparison of three East African education programmes;
4. Options Paper on an election evaluation and joint work with UNDP; and
5. India health and education programme

13. In detailed discussion, the Board agreed that:

DFID/Nike Girl Hub

- DG will be the lead Commissioner on this report:
- the indicative questions need to be grouped more broadly and address the 'theory of change':
- DFID needs to provide more detailed information on the programme;
- a visit to Rwanda should be carried out to see the Girl Hub in action and this should tie into the visit to Rwanda for the East African education study;
- Commissioners agreed to put the contractor in touch with expert contacts who can give an insight into how girls' education works on the ground

DFID's use of technical consultants

- MF will be the lead Commissioner on this report: and
- KPMG has a conflict of interest and the Board agreed that this study should be conducted by another service provider.

Comparison of three East African education programmes

- JG will be the lead Commissioner on this study:
- the Board provisionally agreed that this study should look at Tanzania, Ethiopia and Rwanda;
- there should be some focus on the education of girls, particularly at secondary level, where there are trends worthy of further investigation;
- enrolment, attendance, retention, attainment and 'employability' after education should be included;
- it was important to involve CEGA in this report; and
- JG will forward a recently published education report and names of possible contacts.

Options Paper on an election evaluation and joint work with UNDP

- MF will be the lead Commissioner on this study;
- the study will be a co-ordinated study of DFID's work with UNDP in the electoral area and will focus on the effectiveness of the delivery chain;
- the study will also look at election cycles; and

- it is intended that ICAI will publish a separate report but will share findings and methodologies with UNDP.

India health and education programme

- GW will be the lead Commissioner on this study;
- GW declared an interest relevant to this study as Vice Chairman of the UK-India Business Council. He was also involved in building a school with the Bhati Foundation in the Punjab;
- attribution is important to this study;
- the study should look at exit strategies as funding will cease at the end of this Parliament;
- there should be a case study in Bihar.

Action JG: To forward the recently published education report and names of possible contacts to the contractors.

Action TM: TM to source what DFID spends on education programmes across sub-Saharan African countries and what proportion of their election spend is allocated to UNDP.

Discussion of Terms of Reference with KPMG

14. TM gave KPMG an overview of the Board's earlier discussion on each of the terms of reference and the options paper for the commissioned reports and gave a summary of the Board's comments. An in-depth discussion followed on how to take the work forward.

15. In general discussion, it was noted that:

- the style guide should be followed;
- acronyms should be spelt out in the Terms of Reference;
- Questions and the traffic lights should be linked to ICAI's criteria; and
- inception reports for these studies will be submitted next month.

Action TM/AC-M: To take forward the changes to the terms of reference with KPMG.

Action Log

Outstanding Action from 5th ICAI Board Meeting

TM/AC-M	To consider Water Aid's comments when the terms of reference is prepared for the Water and Sanitation in Sudan report in Year 2		For consideration in due course.
---------	---	--	----------------------------------

Action Log from 6th ICIA Board Meeting

CR	To gather standard guidance for Commissioners to take a view on whether further guidance is necessary.		
AC-M/CR	To provide an outline programme for Pakistan visit for the next Board Meeting.		
CR	To proceed with the process for trademarking the logo in the UK and investigate the costs of trademarking in other English speaking countries and present this to the Board to consider.		
TM	To produce a cost analysis of the reports in Year 1 of the Work Plan for the next Board Meeting.		
TM/AC-M	To produce a paper on how the contractor had set up and costed one of the studies already commissioned.		

AC-M	To produce a programme document detailing information on the studies in Year 1.		
JG	To forward to the contractors the recently published education report and names of possible contacts.		
TM	To source what DFID spends on education programmes across sub-Saharan African countries and what proportion of their election spend is allocated to UNDP.		
TM/AC-M	To take forward the changes to the TORs.		