

**8th Board Meeting of the
Independent Commission for Aid Impact
8 November 2011**

Attendees

Commissioners: Graham Ward (GW)
 Mark Foster (MF)
 John Githongo (JG)
 Diana Good (DG)

Secretariat: Tom McDonald (TM)
 Clare Robathan (CR)
 Alexandra Cran-McGreehin (AC-M)
 Santosh Chana (SC)

Details of the meeting: Tuesday 8 November 2011, 9.15 am – 3.30 pm

Welcome

1. The Chief Commissioner welcomed everyone to ICAI's 8th Board Meeting.

Minutes of the 7th Board Meeting

2. The minutes of the last Board meeting were formally approved.
3. TM led a discussion on a potential agriculture study. The Board discussed how this might fit with the selection criteria and agreed in principle to carry out a study on agriculture. It was agreed that the Secretariat will put together a paper on options for scope for this study.

Action TM: to draw up an options paper on a study on agriculture for discussion at the next Board Meeting.

Action Log

4. TM went through the action log and any outstanding actions.

Correspondence

5. TM updated the Commissioners on the correspondence from the House of Lords Economic Affairs Committee inviting the Chief Commissioner to give evidence for their enquiry into the Economic Impact and Effectiveness of Development Aid.

Risk Management

6. TM went through the assessment of risks for ICAI. There was a discussion of the ICAI model and how well it was working. It was agreed it would be useful to assess this in detail at a future Board meeting.

Action TM/AC-M: to put together a paper for either the January or February Board on the ICAI model.

Update on progress with first reports

7. AC-M updated Commissioners on the fact checking process with DFID for ICAI's first reports. Commissioners discussed DFID's responses and noted that they were generally compliant with the agreed process.
8. The Board agreed to approve the Effectiveness and Value for Money, Bangladesh and Anti-Corruption reports, following amendments made as a result of fact-checking. The Board also authorised the Chief Commissioner to deal with any remaining minor amendments on their behalf before publication.

Programme Update

9. AC-M took Commissioners through the latest update on progress with reports for the remainder of the Year 1 work plan. There was a discussion on how best to carry out the review of technical assistance given a potential conflict of interest. It was agreed that the Secretariat would look at options for this report and how to procure additional support to carry this out.

Action TM/AC-M: to look at options for the review of technical assistance and how to procure additional support to carry this out.

Publication and Parliament

10. CR took the Commissioners through the timetable and plan for publication of the first batch of reports. There was discussion on press coverage, the press release and the lines to take. The Board agreed:
 - that there should be a single press release for the first batch of four reports;
 - that contractor teams should keep a close eye on overlapping recommendations to ensure reports are consistent and that the Secretariat should keep these issues in view for possible inclusion in corporate publications; and
 - GW would carry out media interviews for each report.

Terms of reference for next batch of reports

11. The Board discussed the terms of reference for the following three reports:
 - Emergency response to a crisis
 - Study of the World Bank
 - Management of cross-Departmental conflict pools

12. In detailed discussion on each of the terms of reference, it was noted that:

Emergency/Humanitarian response to crisis

- MF will be the lead Commissioner;
- This report should consider the recommendations of the Humanitarian Emergency Response Review; and
- A case study on the Horn of Africa may be timely to highlight lessons learned which may help in future preparedness and response.

Study of World Bank

- GW will be the lead Commissioner;
- The report should look at DFID's engagement with the World Bank; and
- The report will follow up the Parliamentary Select Committee on International Development's recommendations.

Management of cross-Departmental conflict pool

- DG will be the lead Commissioner on this study;
- The report will look at strategic considerations as well as the cost-effective implementation of programmes; and
- The study should also look at whether beneficiaries are identified and how they are involved in design and delivery.

Any Other Business

Update on possible joint conference

13. CR updated the Board on the possible conference next year in partnership with a charitable organisation. There was a discussion of the costs, benefits and possible attendees. It was agreed that it would be useful to discuss further possible funding sources for this conference, given that ICAI has no budget for events such as these.

Update on fraud and corruption

14. CR updated the Board on the issues raised at the last Board Meeting. There was an in-depth discussion on how fraud and corruption should be reported and the Board agreed that a protocol should be produced in consultation with the Serious Fraud Office, our contractors and DFID.

Pakistan visit

15. CR updated the Commissioners on the proposed visit to Pakistan.

Action CR: to update the Board on funding for a possible conference.

Action Secretariat: to take forward work on a draft protocol in consultation with the Serious Fraud Office, our contractors and DFID.

Action CR/SC: to make the travel arrangements for the visit to Pakistan