

**Minutes of the 34th Board Meeting of the
Independent Commission for Aid Impact
Monday 27th October 2014**

Attendees

Chief Commissioner: Graham Ward (GW)

Commissioners: Diana Good (DG)
Mark Foster (MF)

Secretariat: Alexandra Cran-McGreehin (AC-M)
Matthew Wilkins (MW)
Miriam McCarthy (MM)
Nisha Iswaran (NI)
Sam Harrison (SH)

External: Nigel Thornton, Contractor (NT)
Steve Jones, Contractor (SJ)
Adam Kessler, Contractor (AK)
Marc Stephens, Contractor (MCS)
Alan Downey, Contractor (AD)
Matthew Smith, Contractor (MS)
Leigh Biddlecome, Contractor (LB)
Pete Vowles, DFID (PV)

Apologies: John Githongo (ICAI Commissioner)

Details of the meeting: Monday 27th October 2014, 09:15 – 14:00

Welcome

1. The Chief Commissioner welcomed everyone to ICAI's 34th Board Meeting, including ICAI's new Programme Manager, Nisha Iswaran.

Minutes of the 33rd Board Meeting

2. The minutes of the last ICAI Board meeting, held on 16th September 2014, were formally approved.

Action Log

3. AC-M led a discussion of progress against both outstanding and completed actions from previous Board meetings.

Correspondence and Meetings

4. AC-M summarised the correspondence received and recent meetings held. This included GW's meetings with Dominic Jermey, the Chief Executive of UK Trade and Investment and Ed Humpherson, the UK Statistics Authority's Director General for Regulation. AC-M updated the Board on the Private Member's Bill currently before Parliament.

Risk Management

5. AC-M led a discussion of risk management issues, particularly around ICAI's transition to Phase 2. This included the risk of losing ICAI's learning from Phase 1 – GW confirmed that this topic should be covered in ICAI's next Annual Report, as well as engaging with the new Board of Commissioners once appointed. The latest accommodation position was also discussed.

Transition Update

6. AC-M outlined how the ICAI Secretariat will allocate roles and responsibilities during transition – including providing support to current Commissioners and delivery of Phase I reports, to induction of new Commissioners, engagement of the new contractor and planning for Phase II. She confirmed that Phase I Commissioners would officially be in charge until 11 May 2015, thereafter continuing to oversee the conclusion of ICAI's Phase I work and publication of all reports by June 2015.

Communications Update

7. SH updated the Board on two key issues: 1) proposals for events; and 2) a proposal for additional supporting products when publishing reports.
8. SH informed the Board that the ODI had expressed an interest in hosting events for individual ICAI reports: it was agreed to pilot this for the report on the scale-up of aid to fragile states. SH confirmed that the timing of these events would fit within ICAI and IDC timeframes. GW was clear about the need for all such events to be entirely independent of any hosting organisation. The plan for a conference to mark the end of ICAI's first phase was discussed.
9. SH also proposed that ICAI provide additional summary products to support the publication of reports, in response to stakeholder requests. All Commissioners were fully supportive of this proposal.

Programme Update

10. MW updated the meeting on the current status of the programme. He reported that the Year 4 programme was on track, with the exception of the ICF report, which was being delayed by a few weeks in the light of new information provided by DFID about the Mid-Term Evaluation of the ICF.
11. GW welcomed MCS to the meeting. MCS recapped the objective and format of the Business in Development meeting, to be hosted by the Lord Mayor of London, on 29th October. MCS followed with a discussion on the Business in Development review more broadly, laying out the main foci of the report and confirming country visits to India and Ghana. GW thanked MCS for his contributions.
12. AC-M led a discussion on the International Development Committee's recommendation for ICAI to review DFID's centrally-managed funds. Commissioners agreed to include an overview based on findings from previous ICAI reports within ICAI's Annual Report, for publication in Spring 2015. Then the Phase II Commissioners would consider how to feed this recommendation into their work plan.
13. MM discussed the proposal for a database of ICAI report findings. Commissioners agreed that the ICAI Secretariat would consult with internal stakeholders (such as ICAI team leaders) and the International Development Committee in the first instance, to determine: users and their intended usages, database structure and potential partner hosting options. It was recommended that the database should be developed through an off-the-shelf', rather than bespoke system. The database should also serve as a key resource to minimise disruption between Phase 1 and Phase 2 by providing continuity of ICAI knowledge.

Action Secretariat: To engage internal stakeholders to determine users, scope and structure for an ICAI database of findings

Financial Update

14. MM provided an update of ICAI's expenditure for Year 4 and projected spending to the end of Phase 1.

Discussion with KPMG

15. There was a discussion with the Consortium about the Follow-Up process. It was agreed that key elements of this work would be to examine DFID's response to ICAI's Year 3 reports and to investigate further the flagged issues from Year 1 and Year 2 reports which had been established under previous follow-up exercises.

Action Consortium: Commissioners to be sent the flagged issue list.

Action Consortium: To produce full follow-up proposal for Commissioner consideration.

SMART Rules discussion with Pete Vowles

16. GW welcomed PV to the meeting. PV recapped the objectives, scope, impact and rollout processes of the new Smart Rules within DFID. PV underlined how the Smart Rules form a part of an internal change agenda, and have been designed to create both external and internal incentives for delivery, leadership and learning. PV responded to Commissioners' questions around accountability, capability investment, governance, risk and failure. GW thanked PV for his contributions.

AOB

17. None

Action Log from 29th ICAI Board Meeting (7th April 2014)

Secretariat	To develop a draft a set of protocols for ICAI interaction on Twitter.	Complete
-------------	--	----------

Action Log from 30th ICAI Board Meeting (12th May 2014)

Secretariat	To keep ICAI's website updated on processes related to the transition.	Complete
-------------	--	----------

Action Log from 31st ICAI Board Meeting (16th June 2014)

Secretariat	To produce a mapping of ICAI's country visits to date.	Complete
-------------	--	----------

Action Log from 32nd ICAI Board Meeting (9th July 2014)

Contractor	To maintain database of visits, including details of how many people ICAI met with, where the meetings took place and who participated.	Ongoing
------------	---	---------

Action Log from 33rd ICAI Board Meeting (16th September 2014)

Secretariat	To organise Away Day in Autumn 2014	Completed
Secretariat	To send the DfID SoS a letter on key Phase 2 issues	Completed
Secretariat	To obtain from DFID a short summary of what progress has been made on issues raised in Year 1 and 2 reports since our last follow-up work	Ongoing

Action Log from 34th ICAI Board Meeting (27th October 2014)

Secretariat	To engage internal stakeholders to determine users, scope and structure for an ICAI database	Ongoing
Consortium	Commissioners to be sent the flagged issue list.	Ongoing
Consortium	To produce full proposal for Commissioner consideration.	Ongoing