Minutes of the 33rd Board Meeting of the
Independent Commission for Aid Impact
16th September 2014

Attendees

Chief Commissioner: Graham Ward (GW)

Commissioners: Diana Good (DG)
                     Mark Foster (MF)

Secretariat: Alexandra Cran-McGreehin (AC-M)
                     Matthew Wilkins (MW)
                     Miriam McCarthy (MM)

External: Vegard Iversen, Contractor (VI)
                     Steve Jones, Contractor (SJ)
                     Jon Gorrie, Contractor (JG)
                     Chris Leiter, Contractor (CL)

Apologies: John Githongo (ICAI Commissioner)
                     Sam Harrison (Secretariat)

Details of the meeting: Tuesday 16th September 2014, 09:00 – 15:00

Welcome
1. The Chief Commissioner welcomed everyone to ICAI's 33rd Board Meeting.

Minutes of the 32nd Board Meeting
2. The minutes of the last ICAI Board meeting, held on 9th July 2014, were formally approved.

Action Log
3. AC-M led a discussion of progress against both outstanding and completed actions from previous Board meetings.

Correspondence and Meetings
4. AC-M summarised the correspondence received and recent meetings held. This included GW's meetings with DFID's Secretary of State and Richard Calvert.

5. AC-M outlined the Private Member's Bill currently before Parliament, which proposes to set up a statutory aid scrutiny body alongside legislating for the 0.7% GNI official development assistance (ODA) target. It was noted that, during the second reading of the Bill in the House of Commons, Andrew Mitchell MP had praised ICAI's work to date and Andrew Lansley MP had expressed his hope that ICAI could be granted statutory status through the Bill.

6. AC-M recapped discussions of ICAI's Private Sector Development and Learning reports at the IDC Sub-Committee hearing on 10th September. The Commissioners were made aware that the IDC may arrange a follow-up session to discuss further with DFID its response to the Private Sector report.

Discussion of issues on online fora
7. AC-M shared a selection of online blogs and think pieces about DFID and ICAI's work and there was a discussion about how best to feed relevant thinking from these into upcoming ICAI reports.

Risk Management

8. AC-M led a discussion of risk management issues, particularly around ICAI's transition to Phase 2.

Programme Update

9. MW updated the meeting on the current status of the programme. He reported that the Year 4 programme was on track, with several of the reports due to be published shortly after next year's general election, in June 2015. As agreed with DFID, the Commissioners will receive a short extension of their terms to oversee the conclusion of ICAI's Phase 1 work.

10. MW confirmed that DFID's Secretary of State will be present at the Business in Development meeting, hosted by the Lord Mayor of London, on 29th October. Commissioners agreed that ICAI would do a rapid review of DFID's SMART Rules within Phase 1, to be published by the end of 2014. Discussion of the Follow-Up Review, which will assess DFID's response to ICAI's Year 3 reports as well as further developments on reports from Years 1 and 2, concluded that the contractor should provide a more detailed assessment of the themes for consideration.

11. MW discussed the proposal for a database of ICAI report findings. Commissioners agreed that the contractor will need to flesh out the detail further, including: who is intended to benefit, database structure and costings.

12. It was agreed to hold an away day in the Autumn, including to discuss Commissioners' suggestions for Phase 2 ICAI report themes to put out for public consultation and to present to new Commissioners for their consideration.

Action Secretariat: To organise an away day in Autumn 2014.

Financial Update

13. AC-M led a discussion on ICAI's expenditure for Year 4. It was agreed that, once the final components of the programme were agreed, it would be possible to provide a more accurate figure for ICAI's projected spending to the end of Phase 1 at the next Board meeting.

Update on Phase 2

14. MW led a discussion on ICAI's forward look to Phase 2. DFID is leading on the recruitment of the new Chief Commissioner and procurement of the new contractor. ICAI will work with DFID on the procurement and to ensure that there is a comprehensive induction plan in place for the new Commissioners. It was also noted that the issue of ensuring appropriate accommodation for ICAI in future was important and that, while temporary accommodation was being identified within DFID's offices, we are still seeking alternatives across the Whitehall estate.

15. It was agreed that a letter should be written to the DFID SoS regarding the key Phase 2 issues yet to be agreed: ICAI's staffing model, including an enlarged Secretariat to replace the current contractor management function.

Action Secretariat: Send the DfID SoS the letter on key Phase 2 issues

Discussion of Impact Review

16. GW welcomed VI, SJ and JG to the meeting. There was discussion of ICAI's methodological approaches, including the strengths and limitations of different methods and how best to incorporate intended beneficiary consultation. It was agreed that careful triangulation was vital in bringing together different pieces of evidence. The issue of portability of evidence was discussed and it was agreed that it was important for DFID to apply its research and evidence intelligently to different contexts. GW thanked VI and SJ for their contributions.

Discussion with KPMG

17. GW welcomed JG and CL to the meeting. JG led a discussion on the Year 4 Follow-Up report, including the criteria to be applied when identifying themes, countries, programmes and reports for review. It was agreed that briefing on DFID's responses to Year 1 and 2 reports should be sought for the Commissioner's consideration before a final decision can be made.

Action: ICAI to obtain from DFID a short summary of what progress has been made on issues raised in Year 1 and 2 reports since our last follow-up work

AOB
18. None

Action Log from 29th ICAI Board Meeting (7th April 2014)

Secretariat	To develop a draft a set of protocols for ICAI interaction on Twitter.	Ongoing

Action Log from 30th ICAI Board Meeting (12th May 2014)

Secretariat	To keep ICAI's website updated on processes related to the transition.	Complete

Action Log from 31st ICAI Board Meeting (16th June 2014)

Secretariat	To produce a mapping of ICAI's country visits to date.	Complete

Action Log from 32nd ICAI Board Meeting (9th July 2014)

Contractor	To maintain database of visits, including details of how many people ICAI met with, where the meetings took place and who participated.	Ongoing

Action Log from 33rd ICAI Board Meeting (16th September 2014)

Secretariat	To organise Away Day in Autumn 2014	Ongoing
Secretariat	To send the DfID SoS a letter on key Phase 2 issues	Completed
Secretariat	To obtain from DFID a short summary of what progress has been made on issues raised in Year 1 and 2 reports since our last follow-up work	Ongoing