

Minutes of the 55th Board Meeting of the Independent Commission for Aid Impact

Date 26 September 2019

Board Members

Tamsyn Barton
Hugh Bayley
Tarek Rouchdy

Attendees

Andrew Forbes
Ekpe Attah
Ellie Harte
Goknur Ozer
Miriam McCarthy
Nabila Jiwaji
Lauren Pett (Agulhas item 6 only)
Mark Kelleher (Agulhas item 6 only)
Nigel Thornton (Agulhas item 6 only)

1. ICAI Formal Update

Minutes and Actions from June 2019 Board

1.1 The minutes of the June 2019 ICAI Board meeting were agreed, and the Secretariat updated Commissioners on action points from the previous meeting.

Business Update including GDPR and Safeguarding

1.2 The Secretariat updated Commissioners on forecast spend for year 1 of Phase 3. The Commissioners noted the full year forecasts and the Secretariat explained that the level of spend was consistent with ICAI's overall 4-year budget.

FOI Update

1.3 Commissioners noted the position on FOIs and asked if there was a standard process for responding to FOI requests. The Secretariat explained that these were normally handled by the Secretariat engagement team, but expert advice was available from DFID's FOI Team, if required. Head of Secretariat agreed to brief Commissioners on FOI.

Action 1: Head of Engagement to brief Commissioners on FOI process.

Corporate Risk Register

1.4 The Commissioners reviewed the Corporate Risk Register and noted the update on Review Manager recruitment. Commissioners discussed risks around the selection process for review topics, Commissioners agreed that presenting a two-tier register should be the standard format, and asked the Secretariat to add risks on ICAI's office location, remove the risks on GDPR and transition, and retain the media-related risk as a tier 1 risk.

Action 2: Secretariat to update the Corporate Risk Register in line with Commissioners' decisions.

Corporate KPIs

1.5 Commissioners reviewed and noted performance against the corporate KPIs and noted these would be discussed further later in the agenda.

GDPR

1.6 Commissioners noted there had been no Subject Access Requests in the last quarter.

Safeguarding

1.7 Commissioners noted there had been no instances of non-compliance with ICAI safeguarding standards in the last quarter.

2. Review Products

2.1 The Head of Reviews updated the Board on progress on redefining review products. Commissioners noted that whilst standard frameworks were helpful for most reviews there may on occasion need to be a more bespoke product. Commissioners also discussed the potential benefits of shorter pieces of work, and agreed the framework presented in the paper. The Head of Engagement/Head of Reviews should review the naming conventions for reviews. The follow up review should be included as a defined product and a proposition be brought to the December Board in time for the 2020 follow up report. Commissioners asked for a further review of the whole product portfolio for the March 2020 Board and that indicative budgets be included in the specification of each review type.

Action 3: Head of Engagement and Head of Reviews to review naming conventions for reviews in the portfolio before publishing the revised review products as part of the website changes for Phase 3.

Action 4: Head of Reviews to bring a proposition for the follow up product specification to the December 2019 Board.

Action 5: Head of Reviews to keep portfolio of products under review and return to the March 2020 Board with any updates.

Action 6: Head of Reviews to include an internal budget guideline in each review specification.

3. Review Scoring

3.1 The Commissioners discussed the options for review scoring. Whilst scoring was recognised as an overall positive contribution, there were differing opinions on the merits of producing an overall score for reviews. Commissioners agreed to 1) adding a scoring mechanism to the follow up review product

specification based on evaluation of progress since the original review report and 2) to keeping the existing traffic light system for the scoring of both component parts and the overall review, ensuring broad comparability over time.

Action 7: Head of Reviews to include a scoring proposal in the specification for the follow up review being brought to the Board in December 2019.

Action 8: Head of Reviews to continue to ensure reviews are scored as currently.

4. Communications Update

4.1 The Secretariat updated the Board on the plans for ICAI communications and engagement with key stakeholders including the use of new tools for planning engagement activity and tracking stakeholder sentiment. Commissioners also discussed media enquiries and FOI requests, as well as the website changes. The Secretariat will bring a full communications and engagement strategy to the December 2019 Board.

Action 9: Commissioners to provide feedback to Head of Engagement on website design options.

Action 10: Head of Engagement to set out full comms strategy at December 2019 Board.

5. ICAI Impact Report

5.1 Commissioners undertook a preliminary discussion on the recent report on ICAI's impact. The Commissioners noted the recommendation that the Theory of Change should be updated to include the work of the whole of ICAI, not just the review process. They also noted the proposals made for KPIs and discussed some of the options given in the report.

Action 11: The Commissioners asked that any proposed updates to the Theory of Change be fed through to the Head of Reviews.

Action 12: The Commissioners asked the Secretariat to develop a proposal for KPIs taking into account the report findings for the December 2019 Board.

6. Workplan Update

6.1 The Secretariat updated Commissioners on current workplan challenges, which the Service Provider Team offered to support in any way they could. The Commissioners agreed the current workplan might mean a publication gap between July 2020 and December 2020. The Board discussed options to mitigate this potential gap. Commissioners asked the Head of Reviews to confirm the timing for the Modern Slavery and African Youth scoping work. They also asked for a quarterly learning session to take the lessons learnt from individual reviews.

Action 13: Head of Reviews to confirm the status and timing of the scoping for Modern Slavery and African Youth reviews.

Action 14: Head of Reviews to set up a quarterly lessons learnt workshop with Commissioners.

Action Log from 55th Board Meeting September 2019

No.	Action by	Action	Status
1	Head of Secretariat	Head of Engagement agreed to brief Commissioners on FOI process	In progress
2	Head of Delivery	Secretariat to update the Corporate Risk Register in line with Commissioners' decisions	In progress
3	Head of Review & Head of Engagement	Head of Engagement and Head of Reviews to review naming conventions for reviews in the portfolio	In progress
4	Head of Reviews	Head of Reviews to bring a proposition for the follow up product specification to the December 2019 Board	In progress
5	Head of Reviews	Head of Reviews to keep portfolio under review and return to the March 2020 Board with any updates	In progress
6	Head of Reviews	Head of Reviews to include an internal budget guideline in each review specification	In progress
7	Head of Reviews	Head of Reviews to include a scoring proposal in the specification for the follow up review being brought to the Board in December 2019	In progress
8	Secretariat	Head of Reviews to continue to ensure reviews are scored as currently	In progress
9	Commissioners	Commissioners to provide feedback to Head of Engagement on website design	In progress
10	Head of Engagement	Head of Engagement to set out full comms strategy at December 2019 Board	In progress
11	Secretariat	The Commissioners asked that any proposed updates to the Theory of Change be fed through to the Head of Reviews	In progress
12	Secretariat	The Commissioners asked the Secretariat to develop a proposal for KPI's taking into account the report findings for the December 2019 Board	In progress
13	Head of Reviews	Head of Reviews to confirm the status and timing of the scoping for Modern Slavery and African Youth reviews	In progress
14	Head of Reviews	Head of Reviews to set up a quarterly lesson learnt workshop with Commissioners	In progress

Action Log from 52nd Board Meeting December 2018

No.	Action by	Action	Status
1	Secretariat	Secretariat to review induction of service provider team leaders with the new service provider	In progress
2	Commissioners	Phase III Commissioners to investigate the option of commissioning a third party to assist with data collection for corporate KPIs	Complete