

## Minutes of the 47th Board Meeting of the Independent Commission for Aid Impact Tuesday 5<sup>th</sup> September 2017

### Attendees

**Commissioners:** Alison Evans  
Tina Fahm  
Richard Gledhill

**Secretariat:** Michael O'Donnell  
Rebecca Lefort  
Andrew Forbes  
Kath Bainbridge  
Pauline Worthington  
Goknur Ozer

**Apologies:** Andrea Baron

### 1. Formal Update

#### Minutes of the 27 June 2017 Board Meeting

- 1.1. The Minutes of the 27<sup>th</sup> June 2017 ICAI Board meeting were agreed as a correct record. The Chief Commissioner updated the meeting on progress on the formation of the new IDC and details of the latest discussion with Stephen Twigg about the draft ICAI Phase II Year 4 work plan.
- 1.2. Commissioners discussed recent experiences of liaising with other government departments to organise the logistics of country visits.

**Action: The Secretariat to organise a high level meeting with non-DFID Government departments to discuss procedures for organising country visits at an early stage in the planning of individual reviews.**

#### ICAI Formal Update

- 1.3. Commissioners discussed ICAI's budget and the expenditure to date for financial year 2017-2018. Commissioners discussed how best to estimate the cost of future reviews in advance of the development of terms of reference and agreement of work orders.

- 1.4. Further discussion focused on the use of the fourth Commissioner's days, the costs of work undertaken for and as a consequence of the Tailored Review, and the need to refresh the Corporate Risk Register following the Tailored Review and in anticipation of the possible transition to Phase III.

**Action: The Secretariat to review the distribution of fourth Commissioner's days to ensure they are utilised in the most efficient way.**

**Action: The Secretariat to arrange a meeting in early November to review the Corporate Risk Register with a view to producing a refreshed register for discussion at the December Board Meeting.**

## 2. Conflict of Interest

2.1. Commissioners discussed conflict of interest and new issues arising.

2.2 Commissioners discussed attendance at aid-related events laid on by third parties and the importance of avoiding any actual or perceived conflicts of interest.

## 3. Work Plan Discussion

### Commenting on Review Drafts

3.1. Commissioners welcomed the paper outlining the process for commenting on review drafts and the enhanced clarity it brings to the process.

3.2 Discussion included who should be involved in the process and at what point, the responsibility for driving towards consensus, the role of the Peer Commissioner, the timing of key meetings and the sharing of information with key stakeholders.

3.3 Commissioners agreed on the importance of 'lessons learned' exercises post review to identify what works well.

**Action: The Secretariat to review and update the commenting on review drafts paper to incorporate feedback and re-circulate to Commissioners.**

**Action: The Secretariat to initiate a trial of more structured Emerging Insights meetings with supporting slide packs.**

### Theory of Change

3.2 Commissioners discussed the proposed options for the approach to ICAI's revised Theory of Change. Discussion centred around ICAI's role as a scrutiny body, the differences between scrutiny

and assurance, how ICAI measures the impact of its work and the various alternative approaches suggested in the paper.

3.3 Commissioners discussed the importance of being kept informed of direction as this piece of work progresses.

**Action: The Secretariat to continue developing a revised Theory of Change incorporating Commissioners comments and to keep Commissioners advised of progress on an on-going basis.**

**Action: The Secretariat to arrange a meeting to discuss recommendations on ICAI’s revised Theory of Change before the end of November 2017.**

## 4. Service Provider

4.1. Commissioners discussed the Service Provider performance against KPI’s to date. Commissioners discussed the importance of recruiting review team members with the right experience and the importance of overseeing progress throughout the review by all parties.

## 5. AOB

### Sharing ICAI research and data with third parties

5.1 Commissioners discussed recent requests from other government departments to collaborate with ICAI and obtain access to the underlying data and information gathered as part of each ICAI review to support their on-going assurance work in individual departments.

5.2 Commissioners discussed the mandate of ICAI and the importance of our actual and perceived independence in carrying out our function.

5.3 The Board decided that they will not share underlying data and information gathered in support of reviews but are happy to share findings and engage in stakeholder events post publication.

**Action: The Secretariat to draft a briefing note, setting out the Board’s decision not to share underlying review data and information, to inform future requests and conversations.**

**Action: The Secretariat to respond to existing requests from two Government departments advising of the Board’s decision not to share information and data, but advising that the Board is keen to share findings and engage in events post publication.**

### **Action Log from 47<sup>th</sup> Board Meeting (05 September 2017)**

No.	Action by	Action	Status
1	Secretariat	<b>The Secretariat to organise a high level meeting with non-DFID Government departments to discuss procedures for organising country visits at an early stage in the planning of individual reviews.</b>	
2	Secretariat	<b>The Secretariat to review the distribution of fourth Commissioner’s days to ensure they are</b>	

		<b>utilised in the most efficient way</b>	
3	Secretariat	<b>The Secretariat to arrange a meeting in early November to review the Corporate Risk Register with a view to producing a refreshed register for discussion at the December Board Meeting.</b>	
4	Secretariat	<b>The Secretariat to review and update the commenting on review drafts paper to incorporate feedback and re-circulate to Commissioners.</b>	
5	Secretariat	<b>The Secretariat to initiate a trial of a more structured Emerging Insights meetings with supporting slide packs.</b>	
6	Secretariat	<b>The Secretariat to continue developing a revised Theory of Change incorporating Commissioners comments and to keep Commissioners advised of progress on an on-going basis.</b>	
7	Secretariat	<b>The Secretariat to arrange a meeting to discuss recommendations on ICAI's revised Theory of Change before the end of November 2017.</b>	
8	Secretariat	<b>The Secretariat to draft a briefing note, setting out the Board's decision not to share underlying review data and information, to inform future requests and conversations.</b>	
9	Secretariat	<b>The Secretariat to respond to existing requests from two Government departments advising of the Board's decision not to share information and data, but advising that the Board is keen to engage and share findings post publication.</b>	

#### **Action Log from 46<sup>th</sup> Board Meeting (27 June 2017)**

<b>No.</b>	<b>Action by</b>	<b>Action</b>	<b>Status</b>
1	Secretariat	<b>The Secretariat to meet with the Service Provider to discuss use of modules within reviews.</b>	In Progress
2	Secretariat	<b>The Secretariat to implement changes to diary management processes.</b>	Complete
3	Secretariat	<b>The Secretariat to update the Business Continuity Plan to include information on Business Continuity while on country visits.</b>	Complete
4	Secretariat	<b>The Secretariat to update the Year 3 Work Plan.</b>	Complete
5	Secretariat	<b>The Secretariat to contact the IDC about the year 4 work plan and work with the Service Provider to begin planning these reviews.</b>	Complete
6	Secretariat	<b>The Secretariat to add Service Provider KPIs as a standing agenda item at future Board Meetings.</b>	Complete

7	Secretariat	<b>Secretariat to update written guidance on the process for commenting on draft documents.</b>	Complete
8	Secretariat	<b>The Secretariat to implement actions approved by Commissioners following the revised guidance from the Cabinet Office.</b>	In Progress

**Action Log from 45<sup>th</sup> Board Meeting (7 March 2017)**

<b>No.</b>	<b>Action by</b>	<b>Action</b>	<b>Status</b>
1	Secretariat	The Secretariat to gather views on ICAI's review typology from key stakeholders.	On hold pending outcome of the Tailored Review