

Minutes of the 49th Board Meeting of the Independent Commission for Aid Impact

Date: 6 March 2018

Attendees

Commissioners: Alison Evans
Richard Gledhill

Secretariat: Michael O'Donnell
Rebecca Lefort
Kath Bainbridge
Olena Vinareva
Miriam McCarthy
Cvetina Yocheva
Pauline Worthington
Goknur Ozer
Gemma Kinnear

Apologies: Tina Fahm

1. Formal Update

Minutes of the 7 December 2017 Board Meeting

- 1.1. The Minutes of the 7 December 2017 ICAI Board meeting were agreed as a correct record. The Secretariat updated Commissioners on progress on strengthening KPIs, managing the scope of reviews, the use of each review framework and sourcing alternative meeting rooms.

ICAI Formal Update

- 1.2. Commissioners discussed ICAI's year-to-date spend and the likely outturn for 2017/18. The Secretariat advised that there are likely to be small changes to some review costs before the end of March 2018 arising from changes to country visit plans.
- 1.3. Commissioners discussed the annual allocation of days available to Commissioners and the timing of demands over the rest of Phase II.

Action: Head of Secretariat to formally explore the flexible use of Commissioner days over the remainder of Phase II, March 2018 – June 2019.

Corporate Risk Register

- 1.4. The Secretariat outlined recent updates to the corporate risk register including removal of the risk to ICAI accommodation and some rephrasing of risks to align more closely to ICAI's emerging theory of change. A number of reviews were concluded in January and March and the Chief Commissioner expressed her thanks to everyone for their hard work over this period.
- 1.5. The Board discussed recent changes to the format of the IDC hearings.

Action: Secretariat to continue to talk to the IDC about ways of strengthening the Parliamentary scrutiny process.

Internal Audit

1.6. The Board discussed the scoping document for the Internal Audit which starts tomorrow.

Action: The Secretariat to liaise with Internal Audit to ensure the scope of this audit remains tightly focused. Secretariat to keep Commissioners advised of progress.

2. Corporate KPI's

2.1. ICAI's performance against corporate KPIs over the last quarter is good. Review publication is on track and recommendations are being positively received.

2.2. There was further discussion about ICAI's engagement with DFID on review recommendations in light of emerging findings from the ongoing follow-up review.

Action: The Secretariat to review engagement with DFID to further improve targeting and impact of review recommendations.

3. Transition to Phase III

3.1. The Secretariat verbally updated Commissioners on progress with the transition project. Key programme strands of recruitment for Phase III Commissioners and procurement of the Phase III service provider are on track.

3.2. Commissioners discussed early initiation of Phase III reviews, learning from Phase II, experience of payment by results, contingency planning and updating the Framework Agreement.

3.3 The Secretariat updated Commissioners on progress with conflict of interest issues.

Action: The Secretariat to engage with IDC on any changes to the Framework Agreement.

Action: Head of Secretariat to discuss COI with Commissioner Richard Gledhill and keep Commissioners advised of progress on this issue.

4. Reviews and Workplan 2018/19 – Joint session with Agulhas

Year 3 Progress

4.1. Year 3 reviews are on track. The work plan for March to June is busy and the Secretariat will monitor this closely.

Year 4 Reviews

4.2. Initial work has commenced on most Year 4 reviews.

4.3. Commissioners discussed the Year 4 work plan, agreed in principle to include an additional rapid/short review if progress on other reviews is sustained, and indicated a desire to complete a synthesis piece on Phase II reviews.

Action: The Service Provider to provide a brief options paper for an additional review based on today's discussion and the Board will take a view on this after Easter.

Fact Check Analysis

4.4. Commissioners discussed the Fact Check Analysis paper. Discussion centred around the number of fact check responses, the reasons for them and identifying learning from this analysis.

Service Provider COI

4.5. The Service Provider thanked ICAI for its work on addressing COI issues, but noted that they had not been resolved and asked for a progress update. The Board advised that a meeting to finalise this issue should take place soon.

5. Communications Strategy

5.1. Commissioners discussed and approved the updated communications strategy.

Action: Secretariat to try to access data held by others on readership of government responses to reviews and views of IDC hearings.

Action: Secretariat to organise meeting with the DFID senior officials group.

6. Financial Forecast

6.1. Commissioners discussed the paper detailing the budget for 2018/2019, transition costs and the likely spend for the whole of Phase II.

Action: Secretariat to increase the contingency budget to £75K for 2018/19.

7. Update on Tailored Review

Implementation Plan

7.1. The Head of Secretariat updated Commissioners on progress on implementing recommendations from the 2017 Tailored Review of ICAI. It was noted that significant progress has been made on a large number of recommendations, with some items to be addressed by Phase III Commissioners.

Action: Secretariat to provide Commissioners with information on ICAI review costs compared to costs of programmes under review.

Action: Secretariat to develop options for alternative models for drafting Terms of Reference.

Action: Commissioners asked the Secretariat for a rolling update on progress on implementation of Tailored Review recommendations.

Theory of Change

7.2. Commissioners discussed and agreed ICAI's Theory of Change, the recently developed one page diagram and next steps. Commissioners advised that the Theory of Change should be in the public domain.

Action: Secretariat to look into publishing Theory of Change on ICAI website.

7. Framework Agreement

7.3. Discussed under item 3

8. AOB

Safeguarding

8.1. Commissioners discussed safeguarding both internally within ICAI and as part of the reviews we carry out. ICAI will work with DFID to ensure that ICAI's safeguarding policy and standards remain consistent with DFID's. It was agreed that safeguarding issues would be examined in a number of relevant upcoming reviews. It was noted that there are ongoing external discussions about creating a safeguarding watchdog/advisory body.

Action: Commissioners agreed that ICAI should approach DFID and IDC to engage in discussion and be part of the conversation about the creation of a safeguarding body.

Action: Safeguarding to be a standing item on future board agendas.

Action Log from 49th Board Meeting (6 March 2018)

1	Secretariat	Head of Secretariat to formally explore the flexible use of Commissioner days over the remainder of Phase II, March 2018 – June 2019.	
2	Secretariat	Secretariat to continue to talk to the IDC about ways of strengthening the Parliamentary scrutiny process.	
3	Secretariat	The Secretariat to liaise with Internal Audit to ensure the scope of this audit remains tightly focused. Secretariat to keep Commissioners advised of progress.	
4	Secretariat	The Secretariat to review engagement with DFID to further improve targeting and impact of review recommendations.	
5	Secretariat	The Secretariat to engage with IDC on any changes to the Framework Agreement	
6	Secretariat	Head of Secretariat to discuss COI with Commissioner Richard Gledhill and keep Commissioners advised of progress on this issue.	
7	Service Provider	The Service Provider to provide a brief options paper for an additional review based on today's discussion and the Board will take a view on this after Easter.	
8	Secretariat	Secretariat to try to access data held by others on readership of government responses to reviews and views of IDC hearings.	
9	Secretariat	Secretariat to organise meeting with the DFID senior officials group.	
10	Secretariat	Secretariat to increase the contingency budget to £75K for 2018/19.	
11	Secretariat	Secretariat to provide Commissioners with information on ICAI review costs compared to costs of programmes under review.	
12	Secretariat	Secretariat to develop options for alternative models for drafting Terms of Reference.	
13	Secretariat	Commissioners asked the Secretariat for a rolling update on progress on implementation of Tailored Review recommendations	
14	Secretariat	Secretariat to look into publishing Theory of Change on ICAI website.	
15	Secretariat	Commissioners agreed that ICAI should approach DFID and IDC to engage in discussion and be part of the conversation about the creation of a safeguarding body.	
16	Secretariat	Safeguarding to be a standing item on future board	

Action Log from 48th Board Meeting (7 December 2017)

5	Secretariat	The Secretariat to look at strengthening and building on existing KPIs, including on customer feedback, and linking them to ICAI's theory of change.	In progress
---	-------------	--	-------------

Action Log from 45th Board Meeting (7 March 2017)

No.	Action by	Action	Status
1	Secretariat	The Secretariat to gather views on ICAI's review typology from key stakeholders.	Feedback on typology to be gathered from stakeholders in Autumn 2018 to inform Phase III planning.