

## Minutes of the 50th Board Meeting of the Independent Commission for Aid Impact

**Date** 4 June 2018

### Attendees

**Commissioners:** Alison Evans  
Tina Fahm  
Richard Gledhill

**Secretariat:** Ekpe Attah  
Andrew Forbes  
Gemma Kinnear  
Chloe Lawson-Duffy  
Miriam McCarthy  
Michael O'Donnell  
Pauline Worthington

## 1. Formal Update

### Minutes of the 6 March Board Meeting

1.1. The Minutes of the 6 March 2018 ICAI Board meeting were agreed as a correct record. The Secretariat updated the board on progress with the actions from the March meeting and Commissioners discussed these, in particular action 4 relating to engagement with DFID on recommendations.

**Action: Secretariat to consider how draft recommendations could be shared with departments earlier in the process, including checking whether any potential recommendations were already being addressed by government.**

**Action: Secretariat to circulate a paper to Commissioners comparing the cost of recent ICAI reviews to the value of aid spending reviewed.**

### ICAI Formal Update

1.2. The Secretariat updated Commissioners on spend in the first month of this financial year and the current forecast for total spend over the four years of ICAI Phase II.

1.3. Commissioners discussed the impact of the Chief Commissioner role becoming full time and the increased capacity for external engagement.

**Action: Head of Secretariat to progress the outstanding request for Commissioners to regularly meet the cross government senior official's board.**

**Action: Delivery Manager to ensure induction for incoming Phase III Chief Commissioner includes an introduction at the earliest opportunity by existing Chief Commissioner to the cross government board.**

**Action: Secretariat to investigate aligning ICAI years with financial year.**

### Corporate Risk Register

- 1.4. The Secretariat advised that existing risks had remained relatively stable this month. In what has been a busy three month period major milestones were achieved and efforts are now focused on maintaining and, where appropriate, improving the quality of deliverables and project management.
- 1.5. A new risk relating to GDPR has been added to the corporate risk register.
- 1.6. No further risks were identified.

## **2. Corporate KPI's**

### Review of Corporate KPI Performance

- 2.1. The Secretariat advised Commissioners that ICAI has performed well against corporate KPIs over the last quarter.
- 2.2. Commissioners discussed ICAI's performance against KPIs.

### Proposal for Year 4 KPI

2.3. Commissioners discussed the proposals for changes to the corporate KPIs for ICAI Year 4. Discussion included the need for KPIs to be forward looking, to link to the day to day work and impact of the organisation together with the theory of change, the relevance of different types of review, how to measure impact over both the short and long term and the need for further analysis of accepted/partially accepted recommendations.

**Action: Commissioners agreed the proposals on Year 4 KPIs and asked the Secretariat to develop an impact log linked to the theory of change as a diagnostic tool for the future.**

## **3. Reviews and Workplan – Joint session with Agulhas**

### Progress on Year 3 workplan

3.1. The Secretariat advised Commissioners that the Year 3 workplan was on schedule and by the end of June 2018 ICAI will have published nine reviews in Year 3 – six long, one short and two rapid – as well as the annual report, follow up report and one briefing note.

### Year 4 Reviews

- 3.2. The Secretariat advised that Terms of Reference had now been signed off for all Year 4 reviews except the synthesis report on key themes and findings over Phase II.
- 3.3 Commissioners discussed the scheduling of Year 4 reviews and the need to avoid bottlenecks during the January to June 2018 period.

**Action: The Secretariat to discuss timeframes for the CDC and Newton Fund reviews with Lead Commissioners.**

### Synthesis Review

3.4 The Secretariat presented options on possible topics for the synthesis review. This was discussed by the meeting and conversation included the need for this product not to replicate the annual follow up report, to be relevant, add value and have an impact.

**Action: The Board asked the Secretariat and Service Provider to initiate further discussions with Commissioners prior to producing a short concept note in advance of the September board meeting with a view to finalising the synthesis review topic at the September 2018 board meeting.**

## 4. Tailored Review

4.1. Commissioners were advised that all recommendations from the recent Tailored Review relating to Phase II of ICAI have either been implemented or are on track.

**Action: Commissioners asked the Secretariat to pursue a proportionate response to the annual review of the framework agreement.**

## 5. Transition to Phase III

### Progress Update

5.1 Commissioners were advised that current priority activities are the recruitment of the new Phase III Chief Commissioner and publishing papers for the tender process to identify a new Service Provider. The closing date for the Chief Commissioner advert has been extended to 10 June but this will not cause a delay to the original timelines for this activity. The Secretariat would need to continue working closely with DFID to ensure the project timelines for publication of the tender documents for the new Service Provider did not slip.

**Action: Secretariat to advise Chief Commissioner without delay if the procurement deadline looks like it will not be met.**

**Action: Commissioners asked the Secretariat to review the scoring on the risk register.**

**Action: Secretariat to provide a paper to September board proposing an engagement/activity plan for the transition to Phase III.**

### Internal Audit

5.4 The transition project was the subject of this year's ICAI Internal Audit. The report was positive and recognised the control systems ICAI had in place and made some helpful recommendations that the team is now implementing.

### Updated Guidance on COI

5.5 The COI issues relating to our existing Service Provider are primarily being managed by the DFID Procurement team and work is progressing.

## Scoping of initial Phase III reviews

5.6 To avoid a publication gap at the beginning of Phase III, work on initial reviews will need to commence prior to the start of Phase III in July 2018. Commissioners discussions centred around conflict of interest issues, Commissioner ownership of and engagement with reviews, costs of the work and who should develop the Terms of Reference.

5.7 Commissioners agreed that the secretariat should develop the Terms of Reference for the initial Phase III reviews.

**Action: Secretariat, in consultation with Commissioners, to carry out initial scoping work on Phase III review topics and present a minimum of five options to the September board meeting with a view to Secretariat developing Terms of Reference for 01 January 2019.**

## Developing Terms of Reference

5.8 Commissioners discussed the future development of Terms of Reference and whether this should be carried out in-house or by the service provider.

**Action: Secretariat to revise Phase III tender documents to indicate development of Terms of Reference may be developed by Commissioners and Secretariat.**

## 6. Safeguarding

6.1 Commissioners discussed the paper detailing ICAI's review of safeguarding policies and the proposals for updates. Discussion included the likely scenarios in which ICAI may come across safeguarding issues, clarity of instructions and where to obtain guidance should a situation arise.

**Action: Secretariat to liaise with DFID and further review the wording of ICAI's safeguarding documents to reflect current best practice and circulate revised documents to Commissioners before publishing updated versions on the ICAI website.**

**Action: Secretariat to revise country visit guidance to incorporate instructions for managing safeguarding issues during field trips.**

## 7. GDPR and FOI

### GDPR

7.1. The Head of Secretariat updated Commissioners on progress in implementing the new GDPR regulations. ICAI is compliant in some areas and moving towards compliance in others. The Secretariat anticipate we will be fully compliant by the next board meeting in September 2018.

**Action: Secretariat to provide Commissioners with a note about the personal data held by the Secretariat and an update on GDPR compliance at the next board meeting.**

### FOI

7.2. The Secretariat advised Commissioners that ICAI is now subject to FOI requests and the Chief Commissioner is the Qualified Person. The board discussed the importance of maintaining robust record keeping to meet this obligation.

**Action Log from 50<sup>th</sup> Board Meeting (04 June 2018)**

1	Secretariat	<b>Secretariat to consider how draft recommendations could be shared with departments earlier in the process, including checking whether any potential recommendations were already being addressed by government.</b>	
2	Secretariat	<b>Secretariat to circulate a paper to Commissioners comparing the cost of recent ICAI reviews to the value of aid spending reviewed.</b>	
3	Secretariat	<b>Head of Secretariat to progress the outstanding request for Commissioners to regularly meet the cross government senior officials board.</b>	
4	Secretariat	<b>Delivery Manager to ensure induction for incoming Phase III Chief Commissioner includes an introduction at the earliest opportunity by existing Chief Commissioner to the cross government board.</b>	
5	Secretariat	<b>Secretariat to investigate aligning ICAI years with financial year.</b>	
6	Secretariat	<b>Commissioners agreed the proposals on Year 4 KPIs and asked the Secretariat to develop an impact log linked to the theory of change as a diagnostic tool for the future.</b>	
7	Secretariat	<b>The Secretariat to discuss timeframes for the CDC and Newton Fund reviews with Lead Commissioners.</b>	
8	Secretariat / Service Provider	<b>The Board asked the Secretariat and Service Provider to initiate further discussions with Commissioners prior to producing a short concept note in advance of the September board meeting with a view to finalising the synthesis review topic at the September 2018 board meeting.</b>	
9	Secretariat	<b>Commissioners asked the Secretariat to pursue a proportionate response to the annual review of the framework agreement.</b>	
10	Secretariat	<b>Secretariat to advise Chief Commissioner without delay if the procurement deadline looks like it will not be met.</b>	
11	Secretariat	<b>Commissioners asked the Secretariat to review the scoring on the risk register.</b>	
12	Secretariat	<b>Secretariat to provide a paper to September board proposing an engagement/activity plan for the transition to Phase III.</b>	
13	Secretariat	<b>Secretariat, in consultation with Commissioners, to carry out initial scoping work on Phase III review topics and present a minimum of five options to the September board meeting with a view to Secretariat developing Terms of Reference for 01 January 2019.</b>	

14	Secretariat	<b>Secretariat to revise Phase III tender documents to indicate development of Terms of Reference may be developed by Commissioners and Secretariat.</b>	
15	Secretariat	<b>Secretariat to liaise with DFID and further review the wording of ICAI's safeguarding documents to reflect current best practice and circulate revised documents to Commissioners before publishing updated versions on the ICAI website.</b>	
16	Secretariat	<b>Secretariat to revise country visit guidance to incorporate instructions for managing safeguarding issues during field trips.</b>	
17	Secretariat	<b>Secretariat to provide Commissioners with a note about the personal data held by the Secretariat and an update on GDPR compliance at the next board meeting.</b>	

#### **Action Log from 49<sup>th</sup> Board Meeting (06 March 2018)**

1	Secretariat	<b>Secretariat to continue to talk to the IDC about ways of strengthening the Parliamentary scrutiny process.</b>	In progress
2	Secretariat	<b>The Secretariat to review engagement with DFID to further improve targeting and impact of review recommendations.</b>	In progress
3	Secretariat	<b>The Secretariat to engage with IDC on any changes to the Framework Agreement</b>	In progress
4	Secretariat	<b>Secretariat to try to access data held by others on readership of government responses to reviews and views of IDC hearings.</b>	In progress
5	Secretariat	<b>Secretariat to organise meeting with the cross-Whitehall ODA DFID senior officials group.</b>	In progress
6	Secretariat	<b>Secretariat to develop options for alternative models for drafting Terms of Reference.</b>	In progress
7	Secretariat	<b>Secretariat to look into publishing Theory of Change on ICAI website.</b>	In progress

#### **Action Log from 45<sup>th</sup> Board Meeting (7 March 2017)**

<b>No.</b>	<b>Action by</b>	<b>Action</b>	<b>Status</b>
1	Secretariat	The Secretariat to gather views on ICAI's review typology from key stakeholders.	Feedback on typology to be gathered from stakeholders in

			Autumn 2018 to inform Phase III planning.
--	--	--	---

**ICAI Secretariat**

**June 2018**